ISBN: 978-93-48091-23-9

3. Different Opinions Regarding the Manifestation of Karya from Kaarana: Satkaryavada in Ayurveda

Dr. Swapnali Dadaso Patil

Associate Professor, Samhita Siddhanta Department, Dr. Vijay Ayurveda Medical College, Bhandaha Kala, Kaithi Varanasi, Uttar Pradesh.

Abstract:

Throughout history, two ancient philosophical and medical traditions have coexisted: Darsana Sastra and Ayurveda. They differ in their Prayojana and methodology, yet they have comparable understandings of Karana. According to both schools of thinking, Gunas changed from Karana to Karya at the very beginning of the cosmos because of this. Both Darsana Sastra and Ayurveda view the universe as a complex network of interrelated causes and effects. From the formation of the universe to the advent of humans and the occurrence of diseases, every phenomenon may be linked to its cause, leading to a thorough grasp of causality. Karya-Karana Siddhanta is the foundation of Ayurvedic Cikitsa. An independent Samkhya perspective on Karya-Karana is Satkaryavada. This notion states that before the Karya manifests itself, it exists in Karana in a subtle form. Only the Sat Karana (existing cause) makes all the Karyas conceivable. A hypothesis has been developed and implemented based on this. The idea was that because a medicine contains Karana, it will carry out the Karma. Ayurveda's support of Satkaryavada and other theories recognized by Indian philosophers are reviewed in this article. We will talk about it in this paper. Divergent Views on the Karya manifestation from Kaarana: Ayurvedic Satkaryavada.

Keywords:

Karya, Kaarana, Satkaryavada, Prayojana, Sattasiddha, Bhattisiddha, Asatkaranata, Hetus, Karya, Foetus, Shodash Bhutas.

3.1 Introduction:

The six Karanas recognized by Ayurveda are Samanya, Visesa, Dravya, Guna, Karma, and Samavaya. Based on their existence, these Karanas can be divided into two groups: Sattasiddha and Bhattisiddha. Dravya, Guna, and Karma are the three Sattasiddha Karanas that stand for Sat Karana, which is an actual cause. However, Samanya, Visesa, and Samavaya are Bhatisiddha, meaning that they are perceived in relation to Sat Karana rather than as separate entities. [1]

Philosophers discuss the Karya Karana Bhava hypothesis. This notion was referred to as "Satkarya vada" by the Sankhyas. According to this notion, there should be a Karana for every Karya (effect), and that Karana should be "Sat," or existent. Every action has to have a cause; otherwise, there would be no impact. According to this theory, Ayurveda holds that the body's functions, illnesses, and medicine interactions are all the result of a chain of cause and effect. Without cause, effect cannot be explained, and vice versa. The existence of cause and effect is acknowledged by the various thinkers. The procedure by which the cause and effect are formed is the subject of the disagreement.

The practices of Ayurveda and Darsana Sastra are modern. Although the ideas of Karana (cause) and Prayojana (goal) are somewhat similar, they are promoted differently as a result of these variations. Darsana philosophy dates back to the beginning of both Ayurveda and the universe. The universe is but a variation of Guna, or qualities. [2]

Ayurveda's primary goal is *Dhatu Samya*, also known as *Karya*. Six *Karanas* are stated in the Caraka Samhita in order to make this *Karya*. *Guna*, *Karma*, *Samanya*, *Visesa*, *Dravya*, and *Samavaya* are the six *Karanas*. *Sattasiddha* (real existence) and *Bhattisiddha* (virtual existence) are the two categories into which these Karana are separated based on existence. The impact of *sattasiddha* is truly present. The items known as *bhatisiddha* are more conceptual than actual.

The three *Sattasiddha Karanas* are *Dravya*, *Guna*, and *Karma*. Since they are *Sat Karana* while the other three *Samanya*, *Visesa*, and *Samavaya* are *Bhatisiddha*, it is believed that they exist in conjunction with *Sat Karana* rather than independently.

3.2 Satkaryavada:

A deep philosophical idea that explores the nature of causation and the complex interrelationship between cause and consequence is satkaryavada. "Satkarya," which means "exist effect," and "Vada," which means "theory" or "doctrine," make up the term "Satkaryavada." This school of thought holds that the cause (Karan) serves as a catalyst to bring the effect (Karya) into manifestation because the effect already existing in the cause (Karya) in a latent form. [3]

An appropriate comparison between a seed and a plant is frequently used to describe Satkaryavada. The impact is inherent in the cause, waiting for the proper circumstances to materialize, much like the potential of a fully grown tree exists inside the seed. This theory emphasizes the truth and inseparability of the cause-effect relationship, vehemently rejecting the idea that an effect did not exist prior to its manifestation.

Ayurveda and Sankhya Darshana adhere to the Satkaryavada philosophy. This theory holds that the cause of an action is present even before it manifests. The expressive stage of cause is action. According to the doctrine, the cause always contains the effect before it manifests. For instance, the juice found in sugarcane is non-expressive and invisible. There is a non-expressive stage (avyakta avastha) of the vata dosha dominating sickness. A diet that stimulates vata causes vata dosha to become vitiated, which results in vatavyadhi. Therefore, the vata dosha already has vata dominant diseases. Vatavyadhi is the manifestation of vata vardhaka ahara after ingestion. Diet already contains the nutrients of bodily components. Following consumption, the nutrients support the corresponding tissues. The following arguments in favor of this Satkaryavada are provided by Sankhya Darshana.

Asatkaranata:

The asat (nonexistent form) cannot form the sat (existing the form). The content of the kaarana is not expressed. Following action, the kaarana's efforts express the substance.

Upadanagrahanat (suitable factors):

When creating a specific kaarya or work, specific kinds of kaarana or factors are selected. For the item to be constructed, the proper material (upadana) is selected. For instance, a certain diet including nutrients to boost blood is chosen when the body's blood (rakta dhatu) is depleted.

Sarvasambhavabhavat (particular causal role):

Not all causes can result in every action. Every element has distinct duties that are connected to their functions. All productions require their material causes, just as gold cannot be made from silver, grass, dust, and sand. Therefore, not everything can be created from every location where the effect is present.

Shakyasyashakyakaranata (specific potency):

Each cause has the capacity to produce a certain action. Sugarcane, for instance, has the ability to yield sugar at its highest level of potency.

Kaarana-bhavat, or cause-and-effect similarity:

The concepts of action (kaarya) and cause (kaarana) are interchangeable. Kaarana is the non-expressive or invisible form (avyaktavstha) of action, while action is the expressive stage (vyaktavstha) of cause. The mango tree, for instance, is a result of the mango seed. Mango trees are expressive, whereas mango seeds are non-expressive.

An independent and perceptive viewpoint on the relationship between Karana and Karya is provided by Satkaryavada, a fundamental tenet of the Samkhya philosophy. This philosophical idea holds that before the consequence becomes apparent or obvious, it already exists in a subtle form within the cause. It is adamant that Sat Karana is the one thing that makes all Karyas feasible.

The premise of the hypothesis is that if a substance contains a Karana, it will carry out its Karma, or specific action Karya (Effect) in Ayurveda. In Ayurveda, Dhatu Samya, or Karya, is indicated by Vikara Shaman, which means "cure of ailment." The doctor's primary responsibility is to treat the patient's illness.

The Samkhya doctrine has recognized and clearly defined Satkaryavada, which holds that cause and effect are the same. The Satkaryavada and Asatkarya Vada are the two schools of Indian philosophy (the material effect differs from or does not exist in the material cause).

While Nyaya, Vaisheshika, and some Buddhist schools (Sautrantika and Vaibhasika) believe in Asatkarya Vada, Samkhya and Vedanta accept the first group. According to the Samkhya, the material effect and its material cause are the same. Satva, Rajas, and Tamas are the three Gunas that make up the physical world, and Prakriti is the ultimate cause of all physical existence. Therefore, we experience pleasure, agony, or indifference from everything. The two facets of Satkarya vada are Parinam vada (doctrine of true Change) and Vivarta vada (doctrine of apparent Change), which both acknowledge that the material outcome is the same as or preexists in the material cause. [4]

1. Objective of Ayurveda:

Through the use of six elements known as Kaaranas, Ayurveda seeks to create Dhatusamyata, or the harmony and balance of body tissues (Dhatus).

2. Classification of Kaaranas:

Saamanya, Vishesha, Dravya, Guna, Karma, and Samavaaya are the six Kaaranas. They are divided into two categories according to their existence: Sattasiddha (real existence) and Bhattisiddha (virtual existence).

Saamaanya, Vishesha, and Samavaaya are Bhatisiddha, existing with the Sat Kaarana, but Dravya, Guna, and Karma are Sattasiddha, existing independently.

3. Relation to Darshana Shastra:

Particularly in relation to the evolution of the universe, Ayurveda and Darshana Shastra share ideas, such as Satkaaryavaada, which derives from Saankhya Darshana.

4. Application of Satkaaryavaada:

The concept of Satkaaryavaada is adopted and applied differently in Ayurveda, especially when it comes to comprehending how health and illness appear within the body.

5. Dominance of Guna Pradhaana Chikitsa:

Ayurveda makes extensive use of Guna Pradhaana Chikitsa, or treatment based on characteristics, one of the six Kaaranas. As potential and kinetic energy, respectively, Guna, which is existent in Dravya in an unmanifested form, merges with the body to become Karma.

6. Assessment of Drug Qualities:

To achieve the intended therapeutic outcome, it is crucial to determine the natural features of medications and their effects under various settings prior to delivering therapy.

Conceptual Foundation of Vaad in Ayurveda (Padarth Vigyan - as per NCISM Syllabus)

7. Flexibility of Kaarana Functions:

Depending on how it manifests, a single Kaarana or medicament can serve several purposes (Kaarya), demonstrating the dynamic character of Ayurvedic medicine. [5]

Yukt, or reason, governs this flexibility, guaranteeing a customized response to each person's unique health requirements.

Using the six Kaaranas to attain Dhatusamyata, with an emphasis on Guna Pradhaana Chikitsa, is part of Ayurveda's comprehensive approach to health.

Saankhya Darshana's Satkaaryavaada enhances Ayurveda's comprehension of manifestation and causation.

The intricate and individualized aspect of Ayurvedic treatment, which is based on the yukt principles, is shown by the dynamic interaction between Kaaranas. [6]

3.3 Review of Literature:

One theory that discusses the connection between karya (effect) and karana (cause) is called Karyakarana Vada. Karana represents a preexisting, specific cause that is required for the development of karya (effect).

Samavayi (intimate cause), Asamavayi (nonintimate cause), and Nimitta (instrumental cause) are the three categories into which Karana has been divided. Within the framework of Satkaryavada and Asatkaryavada, the link between Karya and Karana has been addressed.

From the perspective of Sankhya philosophy, effect is a manifestation of karana itself that differs in shape, size, function, or both (Satkar Sharvari & Dwibedy BK, 2016). [7]

The existence hypothesis of effect is known as Satkaryavada. "Karya is present in karana in an un-manifested form," or the pre-existence of the result in the cause, is all that Satkaryavada says. The effect exists in latent form in cause prior to the functioning of cause. The appearance of effect is dependent only on the manifestation of cause. Before it manifests, Karya is still there in karana in a subtle form. Following manifestation, the karana becomes subtle and the karya becomes gross. [8]

As a separate shastra, Ayurveda is said to be "sarvaparisada," meaning that it has integrated a few ideas and principles from other books, such as the vedas, upanisads, darshana shastra, etc. The cause-and-effect theory, or karya—karana siddhanta1 in terms of darshana, is one of the many hypotheses that were developed in ancient times describing the evolution of the universe. There is always an effect from a cause, and this effect could lead to another effect. Every event, from the universe's evolution to the emergence of humans to the occurrence of illnesses, may be found and explained by satkaryavada. [9]

Per Amarakosha, the word "Sat" denotes existence. The philosophy of Sankhya Darshana proposed Satkaryavada, which is backed by the Upanishad, Bhagavat Geeta, and Yoga Darshana. Even prior to the Kãryotpatti process, Satkaryavada promotes the existence of Kãrya in the Karana. Because it is subtle in nature, Kãrya is the changed (Parinama) form of the Karana that cannot be seen prior to its production12. This gives emphasis to Vada Samavayi Karana. [10]

3.4 Objectives:

- To explore the concept of satkaryavada as described in Ayurvedic as well as philosophical texts.
- To Study the Different Opinions Regarding the Manifestation of Karya from Kaarana: Satkaryavada in Ayurveda

Conceptual Foundation of Vaad in Ayurveda (Padarth Vigyan - as per NCISM Syllabus)

3.5 Research Methodology:

The literature pertaining to Karya-Karanavada has been gathered from a number of Ayurvedic sources, including the Charaka Samhita and Sushruta Samhita, as well as other Darshanas (Indian Philosophical Schools).

3.6 Result and Discussion:

3.6.1 Satkarya Vada (Theory of Causation):

The following are the Samkhya's well-known justifications for the Satkarya vada concept.

- 1. Asat Akaranat: Nothing that does not exist can create anything that does.
- 2. Upadana Grahanat: A specific relevant effect must be produced by the relevant ingredient.
- 3. Sambhava Sarva Abhavat: One item cannot produce everything, and everything cannot be produced from one thing.
- 4. Shaktasya Shakya Karanat: "A competent thing produces that for which it is competent."
- 5. Karana Bhavat: The nature of the production is reflected in its source; the nature of the result or production is reflected in the nature of the cause. In this way, the Mahat and the others are found in nature due to these five factors. The same notion is mentioned differently throughout the Upanishadas, Bhagwadgita, and Vedic texts. [11]

3.6.2 Satkaryavada in Ayurveda:

Bhava Regarding Garbha, it has been said that the formation of Garbha is the result of the fusion of six distinct Bhavas.

Different Opinions Regarding the Manifestation of Karya from Kaarana: Satkaryavada in Ayurveda

Matrija, Pitrija, Aatmaja, Satmyaja, Rasaja, Sattvaja, and the other six components are considered bhava, which gives life meaning.

This is about Sat. Garbha is the result of the interaction of these six naturally occurring components. The fetus is where these Bhavas that exist take on their developed form. [12]

• Shad-bhava (6 factors):

- 1. Factors from mother
- 2. Factors from father
- 3. Factors from Atman
- 4. Factors derived from Satmya
- 5. Factors derived from Rasa
- 6. Factors derived from Sattva

• Shodash Bhutas:

Based on mahabhutas, Charak Samhita presents a unique idea of the origin of the body's contents in Garbha.

There are sixteen Bhutas in all who participate in the Garbha's constitution; they are divided into four groups: Matrija, Pitrija, Rasaja, and Aatmaja.

• Garbha Vikas (Development of Foetus):

First and foremost, the soul that wishes to create an embryo joins forces with Akasa Mahabhuta.

Of course, his union with other grosser mahabhutas is finished extremely quickly.

Table 3.1: This is the description of successive manifestations of the foetus in womb

1 st month	When accompanied with all the attributes, the soul, takes the form of an embryo. During the first month of gestation, it takes the form of
	jelly because of the intimate mixture of five mahabhutas. During this month the embryo bears no particular shape and form and the organs of the embryo are both manifested and latent.
2 nd month	During 2nd month of gestation, the embryo takes a compact form in the shape of a knot, elongated muscle or tumor. Pinda (Knot) shaped- male foetus production Peshi (Muscle) shaped-female foetus production Arbuda (Tumor) shaped-eunuch foetus production
3 rd month	All the senses and limbs along with their organs are manifested simultaneously.
4 th month	The foetus gets stabilized. Therefore, at that time pregnant woman specifically gets excessive heaviness in her body.
5 th month	Excessive increase in flesh and blood of foetus. So, mother gets thinner excessively.
6 th month	Excessive increase in strength and complexion of foctus. So, mother loses her strength and complexion considerably.
7 th month	All around development of foetus takes place. So, mother becomes exceedingly deficient in all aspects of her health.
8 th month	Ojas is unstable, moving from body of mother to foetus and vice versa. So, mother has wavering feelings of joy and sorrow. Same in foetus also. So due to this unsteadiness of ojas, delivery during this month is shrouded with danger. So, reckoning of the 8 th month of pregnancy should be avoided.
9 th month	Even the 1 st day after the 8 th month i.e. from the 1 st day of 9 th month till the end of 10 th month is known as period of parturition. Normally delivery takes place during this period

Table 3.2: Elements that contribute to fetal abnormalities [13]

Because of the defects in	Seed (sperm and ovum)
	Actions associalted with the soul
	Uterus
	Time
	Food taken by mother
	And another regimen of mother

Different dosas (vitiating materials) become vitiated. As a result, the offspring's shape, color, sensory, and motor organs are impaired. During the rainy season, wood, stone fragments, and water are forced downward, causing damage to trees standing in river currents. Thus, vitiated Dosas (vitiating substances) affect the fetus in the mother's uterus.

• Vikriti (abnormality):

There are two mental and three physical Dosas (vitiating factors). Diseases develop when these Dosas (vitiating substances) cause vitiation of the body and Manas (mind), and vice versa.

Vyadhi (diseases):

Gynecic morbidities (Yonivyapada) Gynecic morbidity, which in this case relates especially to the mother's genetic morbidity, i.e., ovum, causes the vayu in the fetus to kill the growing organs in the mother's womb.

• Arsha (piles):

The vitiation of seeds (ovum and sperm), particularly the portion of the seed that forms the anal sphincters, is the cause of hereditary piles.

• Kushth (skin diseases):

A child should also be considered Kushthi if they are the child of contaminated sperm and ovum from parents who suffer from Kushth (skin disorders).

Table 3.3: Sex Deformities in Fetus

Dwiretas	When the portion of the sperm and ovum of parents which is
(hermaphrodism)	responsible for the formation of the genital cells of the foetus
	get vitiated and these sperm and ovum undergo equal division,
	then the offspring becomes a hermaphrodite having
	characteristics features of the both the sexes.
Pavanendriyatva	If the testicles (reservoirs of sperm) of the foetus are afficted
	with vata, then the offspring becomes aspermic.
Samskarvahi	Obstruction of seminal passage by vata makes the offspring
	samakaarvahi.
Nara sandha	The congenital lack of strength and passion results in
(male sterility)	impairment and isufficiency of sperm which in turn leads to
	male sterility.
Nari sandha	The congenital lack of strength and passion results in
(male sterility)	impairment and insufficiency of ovum which in turn leads to
	femal sterility.
Vakri	Weakness in sperms of male partner and irregular posture of
(hyposadiac)	female partner during coitus make the offspring hypospadiac.
Irsyabhirati	Reduced passion along with jealousy of the parent's
(mixoscopia)	cohabitation produces mixscopia in the offspring.
Vatikasandaka	Being affected by vayu and agni (pitta) if the testicles of the
(eviration)	foetus get destroyed, then there is eviration of offspring.

Sexual abnormalities can be divided into eight categories. They are brought on by the consequences of a person's past transgressions. [14]

In Ayurveda, both Satkaryavada and Karyakaranavada are recognized and used in the same way. Samkhya explains Satkaryavada, while Nyaya philosophers describe Karyakaranavada. Both hypotheses are frequently used, albeit slightly differently. Satkaryavada, or "existence theory of karya," is the topic of discussion here. This hypothesis states that karana, which is an unexpressed version of karya, is present. Karya is the only thing that has changed or developed. As we can see, the phrase that denotes the existence of merely karya and cause has actually not been looked at. On the other hand, Nyaya-Karyaranavada's hypothesis is a causal one. This philosophy holds that an effect cannot exist without a cause, whereas Satkkaryavada asserts that an effect exists and only takes on evolved or changed forms. Then, it is referred to as creation or effect. In actuality, however, neither production nor creation exist. Only development and modification are present.

According to this hypothesis, Samkhya is thought to be affected by the Upadana Karana. Karyakaranavada is also predicated on the examination of several "causes." Ayurveda uses this principle in relation to Vikasa and Garbh Nirmaan. To put it another way, Beejavada is the foundation of genetic theory. There are two methods to describe this theory: shodash bhava and shad bhava.

Shad bhava asserts that all of the fetal factors are present in Matrijadi bhavas. If an organ's content is absent in beeja, it indicates that the organ is either not developing at all or may be defective. Shodash bhavas also use the same theory. [15]

1. Fundamental Principle of Satkaaryavaada:

According to Ayurvedic Satkaaryavaada, all substances go through two stages, Vyakta and Avyakta, with Kaarana (cause) and Kaarya (effect) being successive stages of the same item.

Conceptual Foundation of Vaad in Ayurveda (Padarth Vigyan - as per NCISM Syllabus)

The Saankhya philosophy holds that Kaarana exists independently, whereas Kaarya manifests itself through secondary variables or Nimitta.

2. Application in Ayurvedic Treatment (Chikitsa):

- Based on the Kaarya-Kaarana Siddhaanta, Satkaaryavaada is widely used in the realm of Chikitsa, or treatment.
- As a reflection of the cause-and-effect relationship principle, chikitsa includes choosing medications based on the hypothesis that they will carry out particular bodily activities. [16]

3. Limitations and Exceptions:

However, the idea of Satkaaryavaada has trouble explaining events like Vikriti vishama Samaveta and Vichitra Pratyaarabdha, where medications function through Prabhaava or other intricate mechanisms. [17]

3.7 Conclusion:

The philosophical landscape of ancient India was greatly influenced by these ideas, which still stimulate reflection and debate on the most important issues pertaining to existence and life. Satkaryavada explores the nature of cause and effect as well as the nature of causality.

Ayurveda, Nyaya Darshana, and Sankhya Darshana all embrace the idea of Karya Karana Bhava. In support of Satkaryavada, Sankhya Darshana proposed the Parinama Vada hypothesis. Philosophers have differing views on the transformation of Karana into Karya. According to Sankhya Darshana, Karana is transformed into Karya and Karya cannot be made without Karana. A conclusion is a conclusion reached after conducting multiple investigations and drawing deductions for a variety of reasons.

Given that darshnika satkarayavada incorporates both practical and clinical features, it can be inferred from the current study that the ideas of darshanas are very scientific in character. In order to eradicate illness, our acharyas have used Satkaryavada extensively.

3.8 References:

- Sharma H, editor. Gauda pada, 9. Poona: Oriental book agency; 1933.
 Vidyasudhakara; p. 10.
- 2. Shukl Vageeshwar Vaidya. Padarthvijnyanam. Revised ed 2004. Choukhamba Bharti Academy; Samkhyakhandam, satkaryavada, p.146-147
- 3. Sutra Sthana. revised. 53. Vol. 1. Varanasi: Chaukhamba Sanskrit Sansthan; 2008. Chakrapanidutta. Charaka Samhita; p. 13.
- 4. Sushruta Samhita. Edited by Jadavaji Trikamji Aacharya. 8th ed. Varanasi: Chaukhambha Orientalia;2005.
- Vagbhata. Ashtanga Hridayam. Edited by Harishastri Paradkar Vaidya. 1st ed. Varanasi: Krishnadas Academy;2000.
- 6. Sharma H, editor. Gauda pada, 9. Poona: Oriental book agency. Vidyasudhakara, 1933; 10.
- Sharvari Ramakant Satkar, B. K. Dwibedy. An approach towards understanding the scope of Satkaryavada in Ayurveda: A Review. International Journal of Research in Ayurveda and pharmacy. 2016. 7 Suppl 4: 31-35.
- 8. Sharvari ramakant Satkar and B.K. Dwivedi. An approach towards understanding the scope of Satkaryavad in Ayurveda: A review. Int. J. Res. Ayurveda Pharm. (Suppl 4), Sep- oct 2016.Last assessed on 3 June, 2018
- 9. K.V.L Narsimhacharyalu, Padartha Vijnana, Edition 6th, 2015, Chapter no 8, p. 355.
- 10. Narasimhacharyulu KVL. PadarthaVijnana. 1st ed. Varanasi: Chaukhamba Krishnadas Academy: 2004. p.354.

- 11. Sharma R.K., Baghwan Dash. Editor. Caraka Samhita-text with English translation and critical exposition based on Chakrapani Datta's 'Ayurved Dipika'. Choukhamba Sanskrit series Varanasi; 2009. volume 2, Ch. Sha.4/4, p.387
- 12. Sutra Sthana. revised. 53. Vol. 1. Varanasi: Chaukhamba Sanskrit Sansthan. Chakrapanidutta. Charaka Samhita, 2008; 13.
- Annambhatt, Tarkasangraha, Pratyaksha Parichcheda, Edited by Shri Satkarisharma Vangiya, Fourth Edition, Chaukhambha Sanskrit Sansthana, Varanasi, 2003, 36
- 14. Chakrapani, Commentator, Charaka Samhita Vimanasthana Adhyaya 8/69, Edited by Jadavaji Trikamaji, Fifth Edition, Chaukhambha Sanskrit Sansthana, Varanasi, 2001,273.
- 15. Yadavaji Trikamji Acarya (Ed.). (2007). Charaka samhita, Sharira Sthana, mahati garbhavakranti Adhyaya (Rev. ed., Vol. 4, Verse 30, p. 322). Varanasi: Chaukhamba Sanskrit Sansthan.
- Chakrapanidutta. (2008). Charaka samhita, sutra Sthana, Dirghamjivitiya Adhyaya (Rev. ed., Vol. 1, Verse 53, p. 14). Varanasi: Chaukhamba Sanskrit Sansthan
- 17. Chakrapanidutta. (2007). Charaka samhita, Sharir Sthana, khuddaka Garbhavkranti Adhyaya (Vol. 3, Verse 8, p. 311). Varanasi: Chaukhamba Sanskrit Sansthan.